

Report on Stakeholder Consultative Meeting through Telegram Group on ESMF for Cambodia COVID-19 Emergency Response Project (P173815)

April 29-May 4, 2020

Consultative Process

Following MOH's preparation of the Stakeholder Engagement Plan (SEP), the first round of consultations with relevant stakeholders was conducted. The consultations aimed to provide relevant stakeholders with generic information about the Cambodia COVID-19 Emergency Response Project, and to seek their feedback and suggestions regarding project risks, impacts and mitigation measures. As a summary, their feedback received include both positive and negative impacts of the project. On a positive side, the stakeholders see the project as part of a measure to improve community and people's health and economic well-being during Covid-19 outbreak. On a negative side, they drew the project attention to the need to carefully address environmental and social risks emanated from project activities: safety of health workers, community, public officials, social discrimination, accessibility to project activities by populations and disadvantaged people. Thus, they suggested that there should be appropriate waste handling measures, including use of equality personal protective equipment, alongside actions to raise awareness of Covid-19 preventive measures among communities.

This second round of consultations aims to follow-up to the previous consultations. The consultations seek to disclose, in a participatory fashion, MOH's Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF), which has been prepared to assess and mitigate potential environmental and social risks/impacts of the project. The consultations also seek to ensure that relevant stakeholders are aware of the ESMF and that their feedback on the potential risks and mitigation measures identified is taken into consideration for ESMF finalization.

Given the success of the first round of consultations, the consultations on the ESMF adopts the same methodology. The consultations were led by MoH's Preventive Medicine Department (PMD)) and caution was exercised in view of the Covid-19 infection/spread prevention. A a number of instruments were followed: the national guidelines regarding Covid-19 preventions and the WHO's technical guidance in dealing with COVID-19.

The consultations were divided into two parts. First a meeting among core groups (within MoH's Preventive Medicine Department (PMD)) with the facilitation and technical support of the World Bank's staff¹. The meeting led to improved understanding of ESMF's risks and mitigation measures among PMD team, which has enabled them to further explain the ESMF to other participants² during the consultations. Second, the Executive

¹ Some Bank's project task team participated in the meeting include environmental and social specialists and project analyst.

² Annex 1 provides detailed list/name of participants who took part in the consultations.

Summary of the ESMF was translated into Khmer, and a set of questions (in Khmer and English) were provided to consultation participants beforehand as guidance.

PMD made significant endeavors to engage with participants in the process. Individual phone calls were made to key participants to remind them of the deadline for them to provide inputs, and to explain to them the potential risks and mitigation measures. While this is the case, no additional feedback has been provided by participants. But many of them have indicated that they have already provided comments in the previous round, and their comments have been addressed in the final draft ESMF. PMD is committed to conduct additional consultations during the project implementation, should there be additional environmental and social risks emerged as a result of feedback by relevant stakeholders identified in the SEP.

Annex 1: List of Telegram Group: Safeguard COVID19-Emergency Response

	Name	Sex	Position	Organization
1	Dr Chap Seak Chhay	M	Deputy Director General	General Dept of Budget & Finance
2	Dr. Hero Kol	M	Director	Preventive Medicine Dept/MOH (PMD)
3	Dr Lak Muy Sreang	F	Deputy Director	PMD
4	Dr Ean Sokoeu	M	Chief of Disaster Management and Environmental Health Bureau	PMD
5	Dr Thol Dawin	F	Vice chief of Disaster Management and Environmental Health Bureau	PMD
6	Mr Un San	M	Deputy Director	PMD
7	Tong Ratha	M	Technical Staff	PMD
8	Nov Molyka	M	Technical Staff	PMD
9	Dr Mok Theavy	M	Deputy Director	Khmer-Soviet Friendship hospital
10	Dr Teng Srey	F	Deputy Director	CDC Dept/MOH
11	Dr Yi Seng Doeun	M	Deputy Director	CDC Dept/MOH
12	Heng Chantha			
13	Che Picheth			
14	Chhan Chansophoan	F	Deputy Director	<u>Banteay Meanchey</u>
15	Dr Mak Kimly	M	Deputy Director	<u>Koh Kong</u>
16	Dr. Muon Nara	M	Deputy Director	<u>Oddar Meanchey</u>
17	Dr. Keo Vannak	M	Director	<u>Tboung Khmum</u>
18	Keo Vibol	M	Deputy Director	<u>Phnom Penh</u>
19	Kong Veng	M	Deputy Director	<u>Ratanak Kiri</u>
20	Kuch Sitha	M	Deputy Director	<u>Svay Rieng</u>
21	Kuch Vanna	M	Deputy Director	<u>Monduliri</u>
22	Lim Chan	M	Deputy Director	<u>Kampot</u>
23	Lim Leang Ngoun	M	Deputy Director	<u>Kampong Chhnang</u>
24	Ngy Bunlen	M	Deputy Director	<u>Kratie</u>
25	Dr Nora D.Nhek	M	Deputy Director	<u>Prey Veng</u>
26	Nuon Seng	M	Deputy Director	kep
27	Oeung Bunsang	M	Vice Chief of Technical Bureau	Kep
28	Pheav Sov	M	Technical staff	PMD
29	Phol Punloeu	M	Deputy Director	<u>Tboung Khmum</u>
30	Dr Chhay Sao Mony	M	Deputy Director	Preah Vihear Provincial Health Department
31	Say Proloeng	M	Deputy Director	<u>Stung Treng</u>
32	Say Savy	M	Deputy Director	<u>Kampong Speu</u>
33	Seang Horn	M	Deputy Director	PMD
34	Sechou Sethychot			<u>Preah Sihanouk</u>
35	Sing Rithireth	M	Deputy Director	<u>Siem Reap</u>
36	Than Sithan	M	Deputy Director	<u>Takeo</u>

37	Nuon Sokunthea			
38	Yok Sovann	M	Deputy Director	<u>Pailin</u>
39	Tek Sopheap	M	Deputy Director	<u>Pursat</u>
40	Tith Vuthy			
41	Ty Thiravuth	M	Deputy Director	<u>Kampong Thom</u>
42	Var Vanna			
43	Chor Vichet	M	Deputy Director	<u>Kandal</u>
44	Koy Virya		Deputy Director	Department of Hospital Services
45	Ouk Vithiea	M	Deputy Director	<u>Battambang</u>
46	Prof. Chau Darapheak	M	NIPH	NIPH
47	Mr Sao Sovanratnak	M	Health Analyst	World Bank
48	Nuth Monyrath	M	Social Development Specialist	World Bank

Annex 2: Guiding questions for feedback on the ESMF

Questions and instruction for the consultative meeting were developed in Khmer as shown below:

1) What are environmental impacts both positive and negative as a result of the project? if there is negative impact, what can we do to help mitigate negative environmental impacts?

១) តើគម្រោងអាចមានផលប៉ះពាល់ជាវិជ្ជមាន និង អវិជ្ជមានអ្វីខ្លះដល់បរិស្ថាន? ចំពោះផលប៉ះពាល់អវិជ្ជមានបើសិនជាមាន តើយើងអាចធ្វើអ្វីខ្លះដើម្បីកាត់បន្ថយផលប៉ះពាល់អវិជ្ជមានទាំងនោះ?

2) What are social impacts both positive and negative as a result of the project? if there is negative impact, what can we do to help mitigate negative social impacts?

២) តើគម្រោងអាចមានផលប៉ះពាល់ជាវិជ្ជមាន និង អវិជ្ជមានអ្វីខ្លះដល់សង្គម? ចំពោះផលប៉ះពាល់អវិជ្ជមានបើសិនជាមាន តើយើងអាចធ្វើអ្វីខ្លះដើម្បីកាត់បន្ថយផលប៉ះពាល់អវិជ្ជមានទាំងនោះ?

3) Who are the most vulnerable groups of people in Cambodia? Why?

៣) តើអ្នកណាជាក្រុមប្រជាជនងាយរងគ្រោះ (vulnerable groups) ជាងគេនៅក្នុងប្រទេសកម្ពុជា? តើហេតុអ្វី?

4) Can these vulnerable groups benefit from the project? Why and why not?

៤) តើក្រុមប្រជាជនងាយរងគ្រោះទាំងនោះអាចទទួលបានផលប្រយោជន៍ពីគម្រោងដែរឬទេ? តើដោយហេតុអ្វីដែលពួកគាត់អាចទទួលបានផលប្រយោជន៍ពីគម្រោង? ឬតើដោយហេតុអ្វីដែលពួកគាត់មិនអាចទទួលបានផលប្រយោជន៍ពីគម្រោង?

5) What can we do to ensure that they can benefit from the project?

៥) តើយើងអាចធ្វើអ្វីបានដើម្បីឲ្យពួកគាត់អាចទទួលបានផលប្រយោជន៍ពីគម្រោង?

6) What is your view about this document (ESMF)? What is your feedback?

៦) តើលោក លោកស្រីយល់ដូចម្តេចដែរចំពោះឯកសារក្របខ័ណ្ឌនៃការគ្រប់គ្រងបរិស្ថាននិងសង្គម (Environmental and Social Management Framework/ESMF)? សូមផ្តល់ព័ត៌មានត្រឡប់របស់លោក លោកស្រីអំពីឯកសារនេះ។